



GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
(ENVIRONMENT SECTION)

MINUTES OF THE PDWP MEETING HELD ON 26-11-2009 UNDER THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF ADDITIONAL CHIEF SECRETARY (DEV.) IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT OF SINDH, KARACHI

(List of participants is at Annexure-I)

Item No.1 **Removal of Heaps of Garbage of Lyari Town, GTS and day to day cleaning, sanitation and disposal of Garbage from main roads of Lyari (Estimated cost Rs. 16.32 Million)**

The Senior Chief (Environment) apprised the Forum that Project Director, Lyari Development Package earlier forwarded captioned scheme costing Rs.16.32 Million with the objective to lift garbage of Lyari from UC-1 to UC-11. The lifting of garbage would be handled by hiring of vehicles which would lift 416 tons / day by making 32 trips / day and lift 3000 garbage which was back log from various localities of Lyari i.e (i) GTS & Mirza Adam Khan Road from Zero Point to Badshahi Road (ii) Suleman Azad Road (iii) Niazi Chowk. S. Waliullah Road (iv) Mughal Godown (v) Khada Market (vi) Mir Muhammad Baloch Road (vii) Picture Road (viii) Haji Pir Muhammad Road (ix) Tannery Road Nallah (x) ICI Bridge (xi) Ali Bagh (xii) Hussain Chowk (xiii) Town Office and (xiv) Gabool Park, MKEK Road and dump at Gondpass landfill site.

2. It was further informed that the Scheme was considered in the Technical Committee on 18-11-2009 in the light of observations raised in the Working Paper wherein following decisions were taken :-

- (i) The Scheme was cleared for the consideration of PDWP.
- (ii) Sponsoring agencies would modify the PC-I in the light of above discussions, observations raised in the Working Paper, inclusion of required details / data alongwith indicating the monitoring mechanism and submit to P&D Department and Finance Department through Local Government for consideration in the PDWP meeting.

3. The Forum was then informed that in the light of decisions and deliberations of Technical Committee meeting held on 18-11-2009, the PC-I of the Scheme duly signed by the Secretary Local Government Department, was supposed to be furnished to Planning & Development Department and Finance Department, through Local Government Department, as was agreed by the Sponsors but the same had not been received as yet. Further, the Sponsors have not intimated whether they have coordinated with the CDGK in order to avoid any duplication of work. Similarly, they were asked to provide baseline data of Lyari in respect of generation of municipal waste, industrial waste and hospital waste, mapping of the area to know where intermediate collection points are available,

methodology, mechanism, strategy, tracking and monitoring system in order to anticipate viable impact of the investment.

4. The Assistant Chief (Env.) stated that in the Technical Committee meeting held on 18-11-2009, Sponsors were asked to initiate mapping of the area to know where intermediate collection points are in place as sweeping of streets would be the challenging activity for the sponsors. He further said that in the PC-I, there is no methodology /mechanism /strategy for transportation of garbage to landfill sites which was having utmost importance to know how sponsors proceed with the process efficiently and effectively. He then said that all types of waste could not be dumped at the municipal landfill sites because scientifically hospital and hazardous waste needs incineration and could not be dumped at any landfill site. As far as industrial waste is concerned, it needs to be dumped separately beyond municipal landfill site. Accordingly, nothing is clear as the PC-I was found sketchy in which the Sponsors have not provided any baseline data. He said that funds amounting to Rs.0.5 Million specified on awareness programme which would not be successful as the common man of the area does not know about the values of environment and repercussion. Simultaneously funds Rs.0.46 Million kept for lifting of 3000 tons waste from the Lyari for which a comprehensive justification and basis were to be the part of PC-I. The forum agreed that above points should be the part of modified PC-I.

5. In response to a query from the Assistant Chief (Env.), the Chief PP&H replied that there was no need for consideration and clearance of said Scheme from District Development Committee (DDC) as the funds would be provided from the Provincial ADP 2009-10 from the Lyari Development Package scheme.

6. The Chair said that mapping of the area would be essential and important segment of the Project to understand the categories of the waste and quantity as to initiate the lifting process effectively. He further said that Third Party Monitoring / Validation provision should be the part of PC-I. The Forum agreed.

7. The Chief Economist said that activities for garbage lifting should be outsourced during the period of eight months and required to be continued further.

8. The Project Director, Lyari Development Package (LDP) promised that the points are well taken during the discussion and all the required details / information as pointed out in the working paper, deliberations and decisions of Technical Committee meeting held on 18-11-2009 and today's PDWP meeting would entirely be the part and parcel of modified PC-I. Mr. Sario Consultant confirmed that mapping of Lyari area had already been completed and would be attached with the PC-I.

9. The Special Secretary (Dev.) said that two incinerators are working under the control of CDGK, which would also cater the needs of hospital and hazardous waste of Lyari. The Assistant Chief (Env.) informed that most of the hospital and hazardous waste was being dumped in the streets as both incinerators do not suffice to tackle the whole hospital and hazardous waste.

10. After detailed discussions, the following decisions were taken:-

DECISIONS

- (i) The Scheme was approved.
- (ii) The activities of the Scheme would be outsourced by the Sponsors and complete mechanism, including TORs and other related information / details, would be the part of modified PC-I
- (iii) Sponsors to include 1% provision for Third Party Monitoring / Validation of the Scheme in the PC-I.
- (iv) Sponsors would coordinate with CDGK (Solid Waste Management Wing) about their plan of Solid Waste Disposal / Management in order to avoid duplication of any activity.
- (v) Mapping of the area would be attached with the PC-I to know the quantity of all type of garbage and intermediate collection points for transportation of garbage. Moreover, Road-map would be designed by the Sponsors to know how effectively the garbage would be removed and would be part of the PC-I.
- (vi) Sponsors would provide basis and justification of provision of Rs.0.5 Million alongwith cost wise/activity wise breakup kept on awareness programme and Rs.0.460 Million for lifting of 3000 tons garbage.
- (vii) The implementation / completion period of the scheme would be kept as seven months instead of eight months as the seven months are remaining in the current financial year.
- (viii) Sponsoring Agency would modify the PC-I in the light of observations raised in the Working Paper and minutes of Technical Committee meeting and above deliberations / discussions and inclusion of required details / data alongwith indicating the monitoring mechanism and submit to P&D Department and Finance Department through Local Government Department for issuance of advice for AA.



GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
(ENVIRONMENT SECTION)

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

PDWP MEETING DATED 26-11-2009

PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

1. Mr. Munawar Opel, Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.), In chair
2. Capt. (R) Javed Ishrat, Secretary (Planning)
3. Dr. Noorul Haque, Chief Economist.
4. Mr. Iqbal Ahsan Zaidi, Special Secretary (Dev.)
5. Mr. P.S Rajani, Senior Chief (Environment),
6. Mr. Khalid Mehmood Siddiqui Chief (PP&H)
7. Mr. Muhammad Jumman Arbab Sr. Chief (EPR)
8. Mr. Din Muhammad Talpur, Chief (Coordl/Dev.)
9. Muhammad Saleem Jalbani, Assistant Chief (Environment)

LYARI DEVELOPMENT PACKAGE

10. Mr. Shafiq-ur-Rehman Paracha, Project Director,
11. Mr. Nisar Ahmed Sario, Consultant,
12. Mr. Rahmatullah, T. O (I.S)