



**GOVERNMENT OF SINDH
PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
HEALTH SECTION**

**MINUTES OF THE PDWP MEETING HELD ON 01ST OCTOBER 2009 UNDER
THE CHAIRMANSHIP OF ADDITIONAL CHIEF SECRETARY (DEV.) IN
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT, GOVERNMENT OF SINDH**

(List of participants attached)

**ITEM NO. 06: CONSTRUCTION AND ESTABLISHMENT OF NEW
CARDIOLOGY DEPARTMENT, LIYARI GENERAL HOSPITAL,
KARACHI (REVISED) (ESTIMATED COST: RS. 170.974
MILLION).**

The Chair welcomed the participants and invited Chief, Health to brief the participants on the proposed scheme. The forum was informed that the project originally was approved by PDWP in June 2005 at a cost of Rs. 39.707 million against which an expenditure of Rs. 42.280 million inclusive of Rs. 17.598 million on the revenue component had been incurred and that as reported, the ground floor and first floor of the building was finishing in progress. Moreover, that the project was revised at a cost of Rs. 191.487 million which was considered by the Technical Committee in its meeting held on 12th November 2008 which was further modified at a reduced cost of Rs. 170.974 million with the list of equipment/furniture etc. reviewed and civil works limited to the original approved scope of ground and first floor.

2. While commenting on the proposed PC-I contents and provisions, Chief, Health added that essential information was to be incorporated in the PC-I which included the details of contracts awarded for construction works along with the civil works which were completed against Rs. 24.782 million incurred and that remained to be executed for which Rs. 12.255 million were additionally required; the unit cost of equipment procured under Rs. 17.598 million incurred with the availability of items procured, for Cardiology Centre along with their functional status; the civil works were executed at a higher rates than the approved provisions, which was to be adequately justified; the revised rough cost estimates appended with the PC-I document were to be properly signed by all concerned/authorized and that the 'Revised Schedule' was to be applied to the works remaining to be contracted out. It was added that the list of equipment/instrument/furniture etc. was required to be properly reviewed and vetted by the concerned subject specialist(s) as it was observed that with the proposed facility to be of 50 beds, the proposed quantities for beds, bed side lockers varied; the provision for Arterial Blood Gases included as with a cost of provision of Rs. 0.100 million and Rs. 0.900 million, was a duplication; the unit cost of Patient Bed, Bedside Monitor, Ventilator etc. was on a higher side whereas the quantities estimated as for Emergency Resuscitation Trolley, Nebulizers, Ambu Bag, Ambulance etc. were insufficient. Moreover, that the list of staff was also to be reviewed as the proposed centre was essentially required to be adequately staffed so that the professional services were effectively delivered.

3. The Additional Secretary (Dev.), Health Department while responding to the queries stated that the proposed centre was essentially required so that the specialized health care facility was provided to the catchment population and that the PC-I would be comprehensively documented with all relevant details and justifications.

4. The Medical Superintendent, Liyari General Hospital, Karachi while participating in the discussions explained that the items procured against Rs. 17.598 million included Patient Beds, Echo, Exercise Tolerance Test (ETT), Bedside Monitors etc. which were available. In response to a query raised by the Additional Secretary (Dev.), Finance Department regarding the supporting staff which included technicians, the forum was informed that the existing indoor patients and OPD services were supervised by a qualified cardiologist whereas additional specialists along with paramedical staff would be required for the proposed 50 bedded facility. Further, that the teaching faculty which included the Professors, Associate Professors etc. would also be associated with the patient services and academic activities. It was added that the list of staff and other operational expenditures proposed under annual recurring expenditure would be properly reviewed, which on completion of the project, would be included in SNE proposal.

5. The forum thereon thoroughly discussed the proposed project contents and the operational framework. It was opined that the PC-I was to be comprehensively modified with all the requisite details without which the proposed provisions couldn't be appropriately scrutinized. Further, that the submission of the modified version of the revised PC-I with properly reviewed requirements, within 03 days was to be ensured by the Health Department and the scheme to be tabled in next PDWP meeting for consideration and approval.

DECISIONS:

- i. The consideration of scheme was deferred till next meeting of PDWP.
- ii. The modified PC-I with all the requisite details and the provisions properly reviewed in the light of comments offered in the working paper and above deliberations, would be submitted by Health Department within 03 days.
- iii. The scheme, thereon, would be tabled in the next meeting of PDWP for consideration and approval.

ITEM NO 07: PURCHASE OF 220 ACRES OF LAND FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF SHAHEED BENAZIR BHUTTO MEDICAL UNIVERSITY (SBBMU) AT LARKANA (NON-ADP) (ESTIMATED COST: RS. 88.000 MILLION).

6. The forum was informed that the scheme, prepared for 200 acres of Land, at an estimated cost of Rs. 80.000 million was considered by Technical Committee in its meeting held on 21st August 2008 wherein it was recommended for consideration by PDWP with a suggestion that the availability of amount required was to be ascertained and that the PC-I was to be modified.

7. It was added that against the original proposal of 200 acres, the Land requirement was enhanced to 220 acres which was to be justified with the basis; the status of Master Plan was to be clarified which was observed as the pre-requisite based on which the land requirement was to be factually ascertained and that the estimated cost of Rs. 0.400 million per acre appeared to be on a higher side, which was to be reviewed and or justified. Further, that the source of funding was to be ascertained which was to be in the light of the decision accorded by the Honorable Chief Minister, Sindh on the Summary initiated by Health Department in context of Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Medical University, Larkana and that a copy of the approved Summary was to be shared with P&D and Finance Departments.

8. Responding to the queries, the Vice Chancellor, Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Medical University, Larkana apprised the forum that the development investment would be exclusively financed by Higher Education Commission for which a scheme was included in the Federal PSDP 2009-2010 with an estimated cost of Rs. 1000.00 million and an allocation of Rs. 300.00 million whereas likewise other Universities which included Dow University of Health Sciences, Liaquat University of Health and Medical Sciences etc. the availability of Land was to be by the Provincial Government. It was further clarified that the Land requirement was assessed in the light of land which had been provided to some Universities in the province whereas 20 acres were added to the original estimate as the same was required for the proposed Public Health College, which earlier was planned to be established at a separate location but now, would be accommodated within the premises of Shaheed Mahatma Benazir Bhutto Medical University. Moreover, that the land was identified by a committee constituted by the University.

9. The Additional Secretary (Dev.), Health Department further added that the approval accorded by the Chief Minister, Sindh was to finance the proposal whereas due to essential financial requirement of the schemes included in the ADP 2009-2010, it may be more appropriate that instead of the required funds to be provided through re-appropriation, it may be processed for the approval to be solicited by the Chief Minister, Sindh for funding the finances required from Block Allocation earmarked in the ADP 2009-2010 for Chief Minister, Sindh's directive or as outside budgetary provision.

10. The Additional Secretary (Dev.), Finance Department stressed on the need of competitiveness and transparency in the procurement process. The forum followed by

detailed discussions, opined that a Committee to be constituted under the chairmanship of District Coordination Officer, Larkana with members from Health Department, Government of Sindh and Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Medical University to ascertain the feasibility of the land available, the cost implications and thereon, to undertake the procurement process in compliance to the prescribed procedures with transparency ensured. Further, that the Summary would be initiated by Health Department with all relevant details and funding arrangement so that approval of Honorable Chief Minister, Sindh was accordingly solicited. This was agreed.

DECISIONS:

- i. The scheme was approved.
- ii. A Committee would be constituted under the chairmanship of District Coordination Officer, Larkana with members from Health Department, Government of Sindh and Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Medical University to ascertain the feasibility of the land available, the cost implications and thereon, to undertake the procurement process in compliance to the prescribed procedures with transparency ensured. The constitution and notification of the said committee would be processed by Health Department.
- iii. The Health Department would modify the PC-I in the light of above deliberations with all relevant details. Further, the Summary would be initiated by Health Department with all relevant details so that approval of Honorable Chief Minister, Sindh was accordingly solicited for funding arrangement.
- iv. On receipt of the modified PC-I and approval of Honorable Chief Minister, Sindh on the funding arrangement, the advice for administrative approval would be issued accordingly.

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS
PDWP MEETING HELD ON 01ST OCTOBER 2009.

1. PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

- Mr. Munawar Opel, In Chair
Additional Chief Secretary (Dev.).
- ii. Capt. (R) Javed Ishrat,
Secretary (Planning).
- iii. Ms. Rehana Ghulam Ali,
Special Secretary (Tech.).
- iv. Mr. Zaidi Iqbal,
Special Secretary (Dev.).
- v. Mr. Khalid Waheed,
Special Secretary (S&T).
- vi. Mr. Muhammad Umer Kazi,
Director General (R&T).
- vii. Mr. Din Mohammad Talpur,
Chief (Dev.).
- vi. Dr. Fawad Shaikh,
Chief, Health
- vii. Mrs. Shahnaz Siddiqui,
Assistant Chief, Health
- viii. Dr. Saima Mushtaq,
Planning Officer, Health

2. FINANCE DEPARTMENT

Mr. Rafeo Bashir Shah,
Additional Secretary (Dev).

3. HEALTH DEPARTMENT:

- Dr. Khalid Hussain Shaikh,
Additional Secretary (Dev.).
- ii. Prof. Sikander Ali Shaikh,
Vice Chancellor,
Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Medical University, Larkana.
- iii. Dr. Mukhtiar Khawaja,
Medical Superintendent,
Liyari General Hospital, Karachi.
- iv. Dr. Rafique Shaikh,
Cardiologist, Liyari General Hospital, Karachi.
- iii. Mrs. Shaista Mubarak,
Deputy Director (Dev.).
- iv. Dr. Abdul Jabbar Memon,
Deputy Director (Dev.).